

MIAU – HU ISSN 141921652 – Special Edition 2019. May

Editorials: The papers in MIAU Nr.249 (2019.V) are products of a new education frame “QuILT” (<https://miau.my-x.hu/mediawiki/index.php/QuILT>).

The goals of QuILT are supporting/conducting Students on the way of KNUTH, who said (1992): Knowledge is, what can be transformed into source code, each other human activity is a kind of artistic performance. It also means we need to leave the world of the magic of words step by step. A solid evidence that we all are capable of going this way is: creating publications behind which the human expertise and the robotized knowledge (like online engines: <https://miau.my-x.hu/myx-free/coco/index.html> --- offering context free = quasi General-Problem-Solving force fields) can be integrated in case of a rational and relevant decision making scenario. The cyborg effects make possible to face the classic naïve and/or intuitive approaches and parallel the optimized approximations. This way can be realized without deep competences about mathematics, Excel (spreadsheets), statistics, etc. The new (inter/trans/multi-disciplinary) way just expects from us to be able and willing to co-operate with the best moments of the history – it means, with the already prepared robotized elements in order to build something creative one!

Critical evaluation of publications

SINGH CHARANJEET, Junaid Ahmad

KJU, Budapest, 2019

Introduction

The affected courses focused on a limited set of strategic principle (like KNUTH’s principle). One of the focused principles was the question: “Who watches the watchmen?” It means how should be ensured that each person/process will be checked/controlled? The affected courses could be closed based on publications. Therefore, it is relevant to present quality assurance activities concerning the publications – and these quality assurance activities may not be executed only by the conductors. Each evaluation task could also be chosen by Students.

The following paper contains 2 critiques.

In the first part: the critical aspects had a structure: the Students should identify problems. These problems should be formulated and even the solutions should be offered.

The second one was created without any structured instructions (coming from the conductors). In this case, just the chapters (just a set of keywords) were declared in advance.

The affected publications being evaluated here and now are publication from Students having the same courses:

- Part 1: https://miau.my-x.hu/miau/quilt/Publication%20about%20OECD%20Statestics_v3.pdf
- Part 2: https://miau.my-x.hu/miau/quilt/tourism_v4.pdf

The process of the creation of publication can also be interpreted here: <https://miau.my-x.hu/miau/quilt/?C=M;O=D>

The following critical aspects could not be interpreted by the original authors because the semester should be closed before. Therefore, a kind of discussion between the authors of the critiques and the authors of the criticized documents could not be realized. In a new semester, it will be possible to analyse, what kind of critiques can lead faster and/or more robust to a better publication?

Part 1

<https://miau.my-x.hu/miau/quilt/critique-exercises-part-1-oecd.docx>

Part 2

<https://miau.my-x.hu/miau/quilt/critique-exercises-part-2-tourism.docx>

Remarks:

- The parts are not integrated into this file, because the change tracking structure is also relevant, and this can be better interpreted in the original versions.
- Parallel, it will be important in the future to create further evaluations about these evaluations (c.f. https://miau.my-x.hu/miau/quilt/st1_all.docx)

Conclusions

It seems to be worth expecting that

- critiques should be capable of leading to operative improvements
- critiques should be derivable as far as possible based on rules (being transformable/transferrable into source code)
- robots should be able to work as a kind of critics and these robots should be able to have a positive Turing-test – it means robot evaluators should have at least the same goodness than the human evaluators